

Minutes of a meeting of the Regeneration and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee held on Tuesday, 23 October 2018 at City Hall, Bradford

Commenced 5.30 pm
Concluded 9.00 pm

Present – Councillors

CONSERVATIVE	LABOUR	LIBERAL DEMOCRAT	GREEN
Heseltine Whitaker	Amran Dodds Jamil Amran Johnson Salam	R Ahmed	Love

NON VOTING CO-OPTED MEMBERS

Julia Pearson, Bradford Environmental Forum

Observers: Councillors; Ferriby – Portfolio Holder for Healthy People and Places, and Ross-Shaw – Portfolio Holder for Regeneration, Planning and Transport

Apologies: Councillor Ralph Berry and Councillor Sarfraz Nazir

Councillor Jamil in the Chair

31. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

No disclosures of interest in matters under consideration were received.

NO ACTION

32. INSPECTION OF REPORTS AND BACKGROUND PAPERS

There were no appeals submitted by the public to review decisions to restrict documents.

NO ACTION

33. REFERRALS TO THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

There were no referrals to the Committee.

NO ACTION

34. HARD INGS ROAD, KEIGHLEY IMPROVEMENT SCHEME - PROGRESS REPORT

Previous reference: Executive Minutes 20 (2015/16) and 29 (2018/19)

The Strategic Director, Place submitted a report (**Document “R”**) which updated Members in respect of the development of the proposed £9.738 million improvements to the A650 Hard Ings Road, Keighley. The scheme was to be delivered as part of the West Yorkshire + Transport Fund.

The report also notified the Committee of an associated proposal to procure works in excess of £2 million, in accordance with the requirements of the Council’s Contracts Standing Orders.

The Strategic Director responded to questions from Members with the following information:

- In terms of the difference between the anticipated 10% journey time saving in the morning peak period but 71% in the evening peak (between the A629 dual carriageway section and the A650 Aire Valley Road (eastbound)), this resulted from the way in which the traffic fed into the junctions.
- The pedestrian refuges towards the Bradford Road roundabout would be moved. They had been located at their current position to facilitate access to the bus stop but this would no longer be there. This crossing point was not heavily used and there would be alternatives both at surface level and via the subway at the roundabout.
- In considering the traffic flow, there was sufficient separation of the main junctions to separate the traffic and so not have a negative impact further along the route. In terms of leakage of traffic into residential areas, the engineers had been conscious of this and would use the signals to try and restrict the amount of traffic diverting in this way.
- The model used to calculate the outcomes had taken into account the housing development and potential development in the general area.

Members commented that:

- The progression of this scheme was welcomed.
- This improvement was long overdue; the current situation was very difficult and it could only be beneficial to get the traffic moving.

Resolved –

- (1) That the progress made in respect of the scheme to implement improvements to the A650 Hard Ings Road, Keighley be welcomed.**
- (2) That the proposed procurement approach and timescales, which give rise to an anticipated start date for construction early in the 2019/20 financial year, be noted.**

ACTION: *Strategic Director, Place*

35. AIR QUALITY IN THE BRADFORD DISTRICT

A report was presented by the Strategic Director – Health and Wellbeing in relation to air quality in the district (**Document “S”**) which was recognised as an important issue for public health, particularly for the elderly and very young.

The report explained that the Council had been proactive in addressing this issue, and had been commended on its good practice, but it had not proved possible to reduce the levels as quickly as anticipated by Government projections. In March 2018, the Council had been required by Defra (the Department for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs) to carry out a feasibility study, over a 3 month period, to identify solutions to air quality issues. Further to this a Ministerial Direction had been served on the Council to carry out a more detailed study and develop a plan to bring forward legal compliance, in respect of levels of nitrogen dioxide, in the shortest possible time. The plan was required to be finalised by 31 October 2019.

The report explained that similar requirements had been imposed on fifty other towns and cities including Leeds, Manchester, Sheffield and Rotherham and Defra had expressed an expectation that the authority would work closely with the Leeds district. It was anticipated that the Ministerial Direction would lead to significant funding and support.

The Strategic Director answered questions as follows:

- The legal limit of NO₂ was 40 ug/m³. The levels at any particular location could vary significantly throughout a 24 hour period and the levels quoted in the report were an annual mean.
- If a particular road/section of road would achieve compliance before 2020 it was not included.
- The Council now had its own monitoring equipment on Tong Street to gather data.
- At this point it was understood that Defra wished the focus to be on the road links that were of particular concern but in the context of the whole district ie the problem should not simply be moved elsewhere.
- Defra had indicated the road links it wished to be addressed in this case.
- There were currently 77 diffusion tubes and 10 full size monitoring stations throughout the district. The placement of monitoring equipment was influenced by factors including the volume and flow of traffic, numbers of buses and HGVs and whether there were buildings in close proximity to the road.
- It was hoped that this project would help to address issues such as those caused by difficulties in using public transport and the impact of the introduction of fines in surrounding areas and older bus stock being used in the district.
- The provision of electric vehicle charging points would be considered but it would require a significant switch to use of electric vehicles to have an impact on air quality. One of the issues with provision of these charging points outside private curtilage was the question of maintenance and liability for the Council in the future. In terms of provision on the public footway, in most cases the

electric supply was located at the back and there were therefore issues with trailing cables.

- Defra had now factored in the issues in respect of manufacturers that had underestimated the emissions generated by their vehicles; this had caused a significant problem in meeting targets.
- These specific routes being specified did not mean that other roads in the district were not considered to be an issue; even below the permitted levels there could be health impacts and officers were mindful of this across the district.
- Annual reports on air quality had been submitted to the Regeneration and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the current monitoring data was published on the Council's website.
- Monitoring equipment was placed in accordance with the relevant guidance and criteria taking account of where there was most likely to be a problem and whether or not people would be exposed to it at that location.
- Monitoring equipment was in place on Leeds Road and gave a picture of the situation in respect of nitrogen dioxide at this location.
- The initiative aimed to improve air quality across the district not just at these locations and would include a whole package of measures to achieve this. This was viewed as an excellent opportunity to gain access to significant funding to invest and make improvements.
- The Council had taken a very active role and done what it could to address the levels of nitrogen dioxide in the district within the available resources but significant investment was needed into infrastructure.
- Compliance would be achieved by 2027 at the latest; this piece of work was about how quickly this could be moved forward.
- There were a number of sites throughout the district where there were concerns about peaks in levels.
- At this stage the level of resources that might be forthcoming was not known. A comprehensive feasibility study, specific to Bradford, would be undertaken and there would then be a need to develop a detailed business case.

Members commented as follows:

- This was a very important issue as it represented a health risk for residents of the district.
- Constituents with no off-street parking had been told that they could not have electric vehicle charging points. There needed to be some proactive work in relation to the provision of these facilities if it was wished to encourage the use of electric vehicles.
- The West Yorkshire Combined Authority was reviewing all buses to give them a star rating. The age of a bus did not necessarily reflect the level of its emissions.
- It was considered surprising that Rooley Lane was on the list as it had 3 or 4 lanes that were quite open, and Mayo Avenue was not when it had significant congestion with a school alongside.
- It was hoped that Church Bank would be addressed as a priority; there was a need for a safe route for walking and cycling.
- It would be useful to have the data for previous years to enable Members to get a broader picture.
- Air quality was a problem and this initiative and the associated funding should

be welcomed.

Resolved –

- (1) **That officers undertake a detailed study and develop a plan to bring forward legal compliance for levels of nitrogen dioxide in the Bradford district, as required by the Ministerial Direction, and submit a further report to this Committee in due course.**
- (2) **That, in light of the Ministerial Direction, the Committee's proposed Scrutiny of Air Quality in the District be deferred until the impact of this work is established.**

ACTION: Strategic Director – Health and Wellbeing

36. CITY CENTRE REGENERATION

Previous reference: Minute 48 (2017/18)

The report of the Strategic Director – Place (**Document “T”**) updated the Committee in relation to the progress made in respect of the regeneration of the City Centre since the last report to the meeting held on 6 March 2018.

He explained that the recent ballot on the introduction of a Business Improvement District (BID) in the City Centre had resulted in a 'yes' vote of 79% which, for a first result, was one of the strongest in the country. Members were encouraged to look at the website for further details of the BID objectives which would be progressed using an anticipated income of £0.5 million per annum.

In response to Members' questions, he explained that:

- In terms of increased footfall, there was a camera on Broadway that was recording in the region of 10 million people per annum. It was acknowledged that there had been some movement from the top of town which meant that the data was not as clean as would be liked but it was believed that there had been an overall increase of between 6 and 8 million visits per annum.
- Footfall at the Broadway Centre had increased year on year.
- The new City Village development aimed to be family orientated (rather than focusing on apartments) and the aim was to encourage a more settled population within the City Centre. Analysis of need and desire was being undertaken and demand planning would be carried out.
- The housing would be a mix of type and tenure to attract a range of people and create a mixed community; this was a great opportunity to create a quality liveable environment. There were well established developments in the locality and lessons would be learned from these.
- The Master Delivery Plan would look at the top of town but also more widely at what was available. It was considered that there was still too much poor quality accommodation and it was very important that the Council got this right.
- Parking in the centre was not a problem during evenings and weekends and was very affordable. In terms of office/college space, the Douglas Mill and

Future House sites had their own off-street parking provision and there would also be parking within the Nelson Street site; travel to this facility via public transport would also be promoted.

- The jobs quoted in relation to the City Centre Growth Scheme were all new/additional jobs.
- One of the drivers for the BID initiative had been to increase footfall in the City Centre and to improve safety with achievement of the Purple Flag accreditation indicating a safe evening/night time environment.
- If the offer and standard of the new bars was right then it was considered that people would use them and they would prove to be sustainable.
- The parking at the entrance to the Interchange was being reconfigured, not removed completely, and this was part of the scheme to improve the image of this gateway to the City Centre.

Members made the following comments:

- Thanks were expressed to the officers for the detailed and interesting report.
- All this work was very important for the image of Bradford; it was crucial that people spent money within the Bradford economy. The report was welcomed and the progress being made was very encouraging.
- The proposed new sixth form colleges were much needed and welcomed. The site near to the Interchange was alongside a gateway to the City Centre and it was very important that this was a good quality development.
- Manchester Road was also a major gateway with a good (guided) bus service; and the area nearer to the City Centre should be monitored to ensure it did not become neglected.
- Efforts should be made to attract organisations, such as trades unions, to relocate in Bradford.
- There had been a real 'buzz' and positivity about the City Centre over the last few years and the increase in footfall was welcomed.
- The City Centre Growth Scheme had made a very positive contribution.
- There was a need for jobs in the district, to ensure that young people did not commute to work elsewhere, and also quality housing and retail outlets. Many shops were the same as found everywhere else and more individual, specialist outlets should be encouraged.
- Footfall to the top of town had been affected by the Broadway Centre and there was a need for something different and special in this location to encourage people to visit.
- Regeneration was always going to be a slow process but the many positive developments were very welcome.

The Strategic Director responded as follows:

- In terms of the quality of housing, the Council only had certain powers in respect of enforcement and there was a need for robust management companies to improve standards. The Housing Standards Team worked hard to establish strong working relationships and encourage better management practices which would then foster better tenant behaviour.
- A two-pronged approach was being pursued in respect of begging; support was offered to individuals where necessary but if there was criminal or anti social behaviour the Enforcement Team took a robust approach.

- There was a great awareness of the need for more individuality in terms of the retail offer in order to attract consumers but footfall generally in the high street was a wider issue with even Oxford Street, London experiencing issues with declining numbers.

In response to a number of issues raised, the Portfolio Holder for Regeneration, Planning and Transport said that:

- A review of parking a few years ago had indicated that demand was greater at the bottom of town. The loss of the John Street Car Park was not considered to be a problem.
- A significant number of people lived elsewhere but commuted to Bradford to work. Regeneration was about improving and growing the region of West Yorkshire as a whole not rivalry between different cities.
- Officers were to be commended for the efforts they had made towards the regeneration of the City Centre, with particular mention of the contribution made by the City Centre Manager and the successful BID vote.

It was noted that local employment initiatives were on the Committee's Work Plan for discussion in February 2019.

Resolved –

- (1) **That officers be thanked for their presentation and the many positive developments that are taking place in the City Centre, as set out in Document "T", be welcomed.**
- (2) **That a further progress report be submitted to the Committee in 12 months time.**

ACTION: Strategic Director, Place

37. CITY CENTRE MARKETS - REDEVELOPMENT PROPOSALS

Previous references: Minute 49 (2017/18)
Executive, Minute 21 (2018/19)

The Strategic Director – Place submitted a report which updated Members on the proposals for the redevelopment of the City Centre Markets (**Document "U"**).

The Markets Manager gave a detailed report and powerpoint presentation on the proposals including:

- A brief history of the markets in Bradford.
- The current provision.
- The work undertaken to date on redevelopment proposals.
- The concept plans for the new markets, and
- The forthcoming consultation process and programme for implementation.

He responded to questions from Members with the following information:

- It was considered important to engage with City Centre businesses, including those on Darley Street and Piccadilly adjacent to the entrances to the new food focused market (on the site of the former M&S building), and it was hoped to increase confidence and encourage the improvement of existing vacant properties in this locality.
- It was anticipated that the new market would act as a catalyst for the regeneration of this part of the City Centre generating up to 300,000 visitors a week.
- There would be a number of different options for the existing market traders who did not relocate to the new market. It was anticipated that a number would decide to stop trading or retire and assistance would be provided to those wanting to find a different location, for example Keighley Market. Support would also be given to those traders wishing to improve their offer.
- Part of the selection process would include consideration of what both new and existing traders were offering; there was a desire to ensure that the best products were on offer, that there was a wide range of goods and that customers were given good service. This was important as there was a need to attract new customers and encourage younger people to use the market.
- Talks were being held with the operator of the Asian market at the former Rawson Temporary Market about their future plans and options.
- The initial concept plans showed a canopy roof extending out over Darley Street at the entrance point but not covering the complete area.
- A marketing and branding company had been appointed to assist the Council with the stakeholder consultation process and in collecting and managing feedback. They would also provide expertise in terms of branding, press and publicity material and creating a strong online and social media presence. It was important that assumptions were not made about what customers wanted.
- One of the major advantages of this new development would be continuity in that traders could close on the Saturday at the Oastler Centre and re-open on the Monday at the new location.
- A considerable amount of time had been spent on modelling in respect of business and financial risk and he was confident that if the right offer could be provided then it would result in a sustainable and profitable market. The overall size would be reduced; the location would be more central; and the food offer would be consolidated to one location. Significant interest had already been registered by a number of traders not currently based in Bradford. A 'pop up' space would also be created to allow new ideas/concepts to be tested out or for seasonal products/trade.
- The non-food offer would be located in the Kirkgate Centre.
- Deliveries to the former M&S store had been via a warehouse building; Vintry House and goods had been transported into the store using the high level footbridge over Piccadilly. Delivery arrangements for traders were being considered, in order to avoid Piccadilly becoming a service road.
- The initial consultation with existing traders had been very positive and they were eager for things to move forward.
- Service charges and rents had not been established at this stage. Some projections and modelling had been undertaken and this had included consideration of other benchmarked rents in other local authority areas. The rents at the existing markets had not changed since 1993 and it would not be

a surprise that there would be an increase associated with the new facilities, although ensuring that costs were not too high was obviously an issue.

- It had been clearly relayed to traders that no priority would be given as a result of length of tenancy. The selection criteria would be fair and transparent and would be developed in consultation with interested parties including the Chamber of Trade, a business advisor and the National Market Traders' Federation. They would be focused on the quality and range of merchandise on offer and the level of customer care.
- This was not a matter of 'lifting and shifting' the old market to a new location; it had to be different to ensure that the offer met the needs of the new customers that the market needed to attract. The available space would be curated with great care taking account of good practice and ideas that had proved successful from other areas. The Council needed to be strong in its belief to seek a new operating model and improved retail offer. Existing traders were aware of the higher expectations for the new provision and a number were actively encouraging the introduction of higher selection criteria. Traders would be supported to make improvements if they wished to do so. Information in relation to stall design, rents etc would be shared with the traders once available.
- Most of the longer serving traders had protected tenancies which conveyed certain rights in respect of termination of their business tenancies. There was an established legal process that would be followed if a trader was not successful in relocating and this would include the payment of compensation based on the rateable value of the business and the length of time they had been trading.
- The food market was projected to generate a £480,000 surplus. Income would be assisted by having a smaller market with fewer vacancies and the building would be designed to be as efficient as possible and future proofed.
- The food offer would be from independent providers.
- The consultation would be concluded by the end of January and contributions by Members were welcome.

Members said that:

- All City Centres needed a good market provision to offer different options to the standard retail offer.
- This comprehensive report was welcomed.
- The report, including the history of the markets, had been very interesting and engaging.

Resolved –

That Document “U” and the exciting design concept for the proposed development of the new City Centre Markets be welcomed and that Members look forward to being involved in the consultation process on the proposals in due course.

ACTION: Strategic Director, Place

No resolution was passed on this item.

Chair

Note: These minutes are subject to approval as a correct record at the next meeting of the Regeneration and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee.

THESE MINUTES HAVE BEEN PRODUCED, WHEREVER POSSIBLE, ON RECYCLED PAPER